

# **EXHIBIT D**

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

SUSAN B. LONG, ET AL.,	)	
	)	CV No. 14-109-APM
Plaintiffs,	)	
	)	Washington, D.C.
vs.	)	May 8, 2018
	)	9:57 a.m.
IMMIGRATION	)	
AND CUSTOMS ENFORCEMENTS, ET AL.,	)	Day 1
	)	
Defendants.	)	SEALED
_____	)	

TRANSCRIPT OF EVIDENTIARY HEARING  
BEFORE THE HONORABLE AMIT P. MEHTA  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiffs:	Scott L. Nelson PUBLIC CITIZEN LITIGATION GROUP 1600 20th Street, NW Washington, D.C. 20009-1001 (202) 588-7724 snelson@citizen.org
---------------------	---

For the Defendant:	Melanie Dyani Hendry Jane M. Lyons U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE Civil Division 555 Fourth Street, NW Washington, D.C. 20530 (202) 252-2510 melanie.hendry2@usdoj.gov jane.lyons@usdoj.gov
--------------------	---

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

Agency Counsel: Ryan Stubbs

Court Reporter: William P. Zarembo  
Registered Merit Reporter  
Certified Realtime Reporter  
Official Court Reporter  
U.S. Courthouse  
333 Constitution Avenue, NW  
Room 6511  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
(202) 354-3249

Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography; transcript  
produced by computer-aided transcription

- - -

WITNESS INDEX

- - -

WITNESSES	DIRECT	CROSS	REDIRECT	RECROSS
-----------	--------	-------	----------	---------

DEFENDANTS':

TADGH SMITH	10	50	114	
-------------	----	----	-----	--

- - -

WITNESS INDEX

- - -

WITNESSES	DIRECT	CROSS	REDIRECT	RECROSS
-----------	--------	-------	----------	---------

PLAINTIFFS':

SUSAN B. LONG	131			
---------------	-----	--	--	--

1 information and what would be its interest to an adverse  
2 attacker.

3 Q But if that information were conveyed in a  
4 spreadsheet column header in plain English as opposed to in  
5 the form of an abbreviation underbar status, does that  
6 create a threat that is unacceptable?

7 A As an attempt to mitigate that threat by not using  
8 the actual field name, but, instead, using a plain-language  
9 description of the data that we're responding with.

10 Q Is any knowledge with respect to the contents of  
11 your database, is that a threat?

12 A Any knowledge?

13 Q Any knowledge. Any release of information about  
14 what's in your database, does that constitute a threat?

15 A No. It's -- the contents of our database are  
16 subject to FOIA, and we've produced data from our database  
17 for that reason.

18 Q And where do you draw the line between what kind  
19 of information is an unacceptable threat and what kind of  
20 information is acceptable?

21 A When it describes the organization of our data and  
22 the structure of our databases.

23 Q Is any information about the organization and  
24 structure of your database an unacceptable threat?

25 A I don't know what you're getting at.

1           Q     Well, if you produce a table of -- a spreadsheet  
2     that lists, let's say, information about detainers and it  
3     has a column heading that says, "Detainer issue date," that  
4     reveals to someone, does it not, that your database contains  
5     fields of information that that heading describes, right?

6           A     It does.

7           Q     And that doesn't pose an unacceptable risk?

8           A     No.

9           Q     And if that happens to be the actual name of a  
10    field from the IIDS with spaces replacing underscores, does  
11    it, then, create an unacceptable risk?

12          A     I don't think so, no. Not in that example.

13          Q     I'd like to ask you about the codes that are found  
14    in some fields in the database.

15                Tell me what you mean by a "code."

16          A     A "code" is a shortened string of information  
17    meant to link to more expanded bits of information.

18          Q     And the code is an entry within a field in the  
19    database, right?

20          A     Correct.

21          Q     And somewhere, there's a translation of what that  
22    code means that allows somebody to understand it, correct?

23          A     Yes. Typically, there's a description for the  
24    code.

25          Q     And let me show you what's been marked as